

# Thinking Is Good For You

---

Explorations in the Philosophy of Epidemiology  
and Population Health

Alexander Broadbent

Draft for Review 29 June 2012

---

None of my nine viewpoints can bring indisputable evidence for or against the cause-and-effect hypothesis and none can be required as a sine qua non. What they can do, with greater or less strength, is to help us to make up our minds on the fundamental question – is there any other way of explaining the set of facts before us, is there any other answer equally, or more, likely than cause and effect?

*Austin Bradford Hill (1965, 299)*

---

---

Matters are always likely to be more complicated than one thinks...

*Nancy Cartwright (1989, 72)*

---

## CONTENTS

|   |                                     |
|---|-------------------------------------|
| Acknowledgements.....                             | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Glossary .....                                    | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Abbreviations .....                               | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| 1. Why Philosophy of Epidemiology?.....           | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Introducing the Philosophy of Epidemiology .....  | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Themes.....                                       | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Synopsis.....                                     | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| 2. Philosophical and Epidemiological Basics ..... | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Summary .....                                     | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| The Problem of Induction .....                    | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| From Induction to Causation .....                 | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Epidemiology: a Potted History.....               | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Basic Concepts of Modern Epidemiology.....        | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Conclusion .....                                  | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| 3. The Causal Interpretation Problem .....        | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Summary .....                                     | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| The Causal Interpretation Problem .....           | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| The Search for the Extra Ingredient.....          | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| The Probabilistic Approach.....                   | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| The Counterfactual Approach .....                 | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |

|   |                                     |
|---|-------------------------------------|
| The Explanatory Approach.....                       | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Conclusion .....                                    | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| 4. Translation, Formal Methods, and Stability ..... | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Summary .....                                       | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| What Makes a Good Causal Inference? .....           | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| The Myth of “Translation” .....                     | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Stability.....                                      | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| The Limitations of Formal Methods.....              | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Conclusion .....                                    | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| 5. A Model of Stable Causal Inference .....         | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Summary .....                                       | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| The Model .....                                     | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Relevant Alternative Hypotheses.....                | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Elimination of Hypotheses.....                      | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Eliminating Alternatives and Stability .....        | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Being Stable vs. Being Regarded as Stable .....     | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Stability and Explanation .....                     | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Conclusion .....                                    | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| 6. Prediction.....                                  | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Summary .....                                       | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| From Causation to Prediction.....                   | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| A Mysterious Omission.....                          | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| What is a Good Prediction?.....                     | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |

|   |                                     |
|---|-------------------------------------|
| Predicting Reliably and Predicting Justifiably .....            | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Conclusion .....  | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| 7. Making and Assessing Epidemiological Predictions .....       | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Summary .....   | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Extrapolation.....  | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Inference From Laws of Nature .....                             | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Knowledge of Underlying Mechanisms .....                        | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Causal Knowledge .....  | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Prediction as the Point of Explanation in Epidemiology .....    | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Eliminating Relevant Interferers.....                           | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Conclusion .....  | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| 8. Puzzles of Attributability.....                              | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Summary .....   | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Two Common Errors in Understanding Attributable Fraction .      | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| The Exclusive Cause Fallacy .....                               | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| The Counterfactual Fallacy .....                                | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Must Excess Fractions Be Causally Interpreted? .....            | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| “Attributable To” as “Explained By” .....                       | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Conclusion .....  | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| 9. Risk Relativism, Interaction, and the Shadow of Physics..... | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Summary .....   | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Risk Relativism .....   | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Estimating RR from Case-Control Studies.....                    | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |

|   |                                     |
|---|-------------------------------------|
| The Uses of RR in Causal Inference .....                                    | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Are Risk Ratios Transferable? .....   | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| The Shadow of Physical Law .....  | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Conclusion .....  | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| 10. Multifactorialism and Beyond.....                                       | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Summary .....   | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Epidemiology and the Scope of Medicine .....                                | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Monocausal vs. Multifactorial Models of Disease .....                       | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Why Not Catalogue Risk Factors? .....                                       | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| The Contrastive Model of Disease.....                                       | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Conclusion .....  | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| 11. Epidemiology and the Law.....   | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Summary .....   | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Why Use Epidemiological Evidence in Lawsuits? .....                         | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Legal Positions and Contortions.....  | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Epidemiological Evidence As Irrelevant to Proof of Specific Causation ..... | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Epidemiological Evidence as a Trigger for Relaxing Causation Rules ..       | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| Epidemiological Evidence as Adequate when $RR > 2$ .....                    | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| A Crucial Distinction.....  | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| What Does Epidemiological Evidence Say? .....                               | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |
| What Can Epidemiological Evidence Prove? .....                              | <b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b> |

Conclusion ..... **Error! Bookmark not defined.**

12. Is Thinking Good For You? ..... **Error! Bookmark not defined.**

References ..... **Error! Bookmark not defined.**

Cases ..... **Error! Bookmark not defined.**

    American ..... **Error! Bookmark not defined.**

    Scottish..... **Error! Bookmark not defined.**

    English..... **Error! Bookmark not defined.**

Index ..... **Error! Bookmark not defined.**